MARKET ORIENTATION IN LOCAL GOVERNMENT THROUGH THE ANALYSIS OF MUNICIPAL WEBSITE CONTENT: A FRAMEWORK FOR ITS MEASUREMENT

Lucía Sáez Vegas, The University of the Basque Country
Iñaki Periáñez Cañadillas, The University of the Basque Country

ABSTRACT

Increased competition between cities requires them to adopt concepts and methods that have been used by the private sector, such as market orientation, strategic management, marketing, human resources management, competitive advantage or the definition of a competitive image and brand, etc. The aim of this study is to analyze the market orientation in Spain's regional capital cities by examining the content of their municipal websites. Local governments are increasingly represented on the Internet. The Internet enables them to combine elements of a town hall, tourist information bureau, chamber of commerce, business directory, shopping mall and local newsmagazine. This study also analyses whether, as a result of market orientation in management, the cities studied have fostered marketing strategies, such as the segmentation strategy, brand strategy, or city internationalisation, and it proposes a standard framework for measuring the city's market orientation by examining the content of the municipal website.

JEL: M31

KEYWORDS: Market Orientation, Local Government, Websites, Competitive Advantages.

INTRODUCTION

One of the most important phenomenons in the late twentieth century was the globalization of the international economy. This process was made possible by the development of world trade and elimination of trade barriers, in addition to the new communication technologies that have increased the chances of entering larger, faraway markets. Hence, the world has become a "global village" in which ideas are available anywhere and anytime and products and capital flow in a flexible and dynamic manner. Faced with a global economy and as integration processes intensify, the role of cities and competition among them has become more significant. Cities face the challenge of being able not only to manage the resources at their disposal, but also to attract new resources, forcing local authorities to make decisions that optimize their intervention styles, in order to thus achieve greater competitiveness at the regional, national, and/or international levels.

This situation has forced cities to adopt business management principles, concepts and tools, such as market orientation, strategic planning, marketing, human resource management, the search for differentiation, definition of an adequate image, brand and positioning and, in short, a number of competitive advantages that allow them to meet the demands of all their target audiences and face the competition. In this vein, the adoption of market orientation is considered equivalent to developing a competitive advantage for the organization that is based on identifying, creating value and achieving customer satisfaction.

Research studies such as those conducted in the business world on market orientation, which are widely discussed in marketing literature, are also needed in the area of public management, more specifically, research on the market orientation of local public administrations. On the basis of this approach, this paper aims to analyze the market orientation of a cluster of Spanish cities that are the capitals of their autonomous regions through the analysis of their municipal website content.

The analysis considered a set of variables representing the different dimensions that shape market orientation. The presence of local governments on the Internet is growing and the advantages it offers as a marketing tool (Küster, 2002; Currás and Küster, 2005), such as accessibility to information, offering relevant information, complaints management, low cost and customer service, are considerable, although research on the role it plays in urban management has not been studied in depth (Sicilia and Pérez, 2007). In this study we propose a standard measurement framework to measure a city's market orientation through its municipal website content.

The next section summarizes the literature review of the main authors who have studied the Market Orientation. The data and methodology section analyses the market orientation in major Spanish cities on the basis of their municipal website content. From this analysis the variables to be considered in modelling the measurement of the city's market orientation through the content of the municipal website are obtained. The last section concludes this paper.

LITERATURE REVIEW

The implementation of the marketing philosophy and principles in cities requires market-driven planning, which involves an orientation in all actions towards the different target audiences, rather than towards service offerings, as in the past. This means focusing on achieving greater competitiveness, ascertaining the city's competitive advantage and ensuring that this advantage is sustainable in the long term. A review of the literature on market orientation reveals the existence of a multiplicity of views and approaches in its study, although the most recent works tend to synthesize them all into no more than four. Thus, authors such as Cervera *et al*. (1999) or Tuominen and Möller (1996) consider these four approaches - cognitive, behavioural, cultural and market orientation - on the basis of the theory of resources and capabilities. The importance of an organization's providing itself with this market orientation approach will involve developing processes for collecting, interpreting, disseminating and using market information on customers, competitors, distributors and suppliers.

These processes are carried out in a more systematic and predictable manner in organizations that have a greater degree of market orientation (Martín Armario *et al.,* 2002). Furthermore, adopting a market orientation makes organizations capable of developing responses that best meet customers' current needs and desires and allows their future needs and desires to be anticipated (Kohli and Jaworski, 1990; Narver and Slater, 1990).However, the proliferation of studies on market orientation in the business world has not occurred to the same degree as it has in other areas of activity. Thus, the public administration has barely developed any market orientation studies and only a few studies that focus on this issue exist. Within the context of local government, market orientation appears as "Public Service Orientation" to mean "*a philosophy that guides local authorities, who try to tackle the challenge of developing new patterns of more sensitive. It is based on the simple idea that local authorities should provide services for and with people, not simply to them*"(Walsh, 1989) and this must be reflected in organizations' systems, structure, processes, and culture. This philosophy and the actions consistently developed from both a theoretical and practical standpoint consider the conditions needed to introduce the concept of marketing in the public arena, as well as the resulting market orientation of its institutions, to thus reflect the two essential features of any public organization: being a *service provider* entity and being a *public institution*. (Cervera, 2004).

On the basis of this situation, the analysis of market orientation at the municipal level can be conducted along the lines of Kohli and Jaworski's basic model (1990) of market orientation from a behavioural perspective. This model has also been applied in the field of local governments and its consequences on citizen participation has been analyzed (Cervera, 2004). According to this model, the core of this orientation in the profit and not-for-profit, private and public sectors rests on three pillars: *generation of information* from the market that makes it possible to understand their needs, *dissemination* of that

information to share that understanding and lastly, *responsiveness* to the information in order to satisfy market needs. The three dimensions considered for analyzing market orientation from a behavioural perspective have been thoroughly analyzed by different authors and the main conclusions with respect to each are shown in Tables 1, 2 and 3.

Table 1: Generation of Information

GENERATION OF INFORMATION	
► Collection and analysis of information on the current and future needs of the cities' different target audiences. ► Collection and analysis of information on factors external to the organization that have an impact on the current and future needs of the city's target audiences. ► Collection and analysis of information on actions by the competition that influence the current and future needs of the city's different target audiences.	
Study	**Generating information from the market for its understanding.**
Cowell (1981)	Understanding of the publics' points of view and improvement in the impact and quality of the authorities' decisions in such a way that the approaches of the government and approaches of the citizens it serves are combined.
Kerley (1994); Burns (1992); Blackman (1994); Severijnen (1994)	Knowledge of citizens' demands (Kerley, 1994), desires (Burns, 1992) and needs (Blackman, 1994) when the information provided by voting mechanisms is not considered sufficient (Severijnen, 1994); the localization of resources and definition of objectives (Blackman, 1994); evaluation of the political programmes (Severijnen, 1994), helping to establish performance indicators sensitive to citizens' satisfaction, as well as performance monitoring in relation to these indicators and review of the quality of services (Burns, 1992); and lastly, the provision of information to help implement the organizational change needed (Burns, 1992; Severijnen, 1994) in order to achieve more consumer-oriented institutions.
Blackman (1994)	In addition to information about the needs of the public and the environment, the need to search for information on their satisfaction must be considered. The actions that must be undertaken to satisfy citizens can only be determined by establishing public action and quality indicators that contrast with the users' point of view.
Kohli and Jaworski (1990); Clarke and Stewart (1988)	For the sake of completeness, collection methods must be formal and informal and developed by all members of the organization (Kohli and Jaworski, 1990). Local authorities should also provide quantitative and qualitative information on their markets (Clarke and Stewart, 1988) that comes from not only citizens, but also from public employees themselves.

Analysis of the different authors and main conclusions of the Generation of Information dimension, corresponding to Kohli and Jaworski's behavioural perspective of market orientation (1990). Source: in-house based on Cervera, A. (2004)

Table 2: Dissemination of Information

DISSEMINATION OF INFORMATION	
► Dissemination throughout the organization of information on the current and future needs of the market, the environment and the competition, doing so through vertical and horizontal flows between departments and within the departments themselves. ► Establishment of appropriate coordination mechanisms to ensure the generation of, dissemination of and responsiveness to information that integrates and orients all departments and their staff towards the market.	
Study	**Dissemination of information to share an understanding of the market**
Kohli and Jaworski (1990)	Various methods are proposed for disseminating information throughout an organization, using methods such as letters, newsletters and formal meetings, etc., as well as various other informal methods through both horizontal and (ascending or descending) vertical information flows.
Varadajan and Clark (1994); Crittenden, Gardiner and Stam (1993); Walker and Ruekert (1987); Masiello (1988)	The hierarchical conceptualization of the strategy at different levels of the organization generates interactions and overlaps among these levels (Varadajan and Clark, 1994), depending on the effective implementation of the coordinated work of the various functional groups (Crittenden, Gardiner and Stam, 1993). This implementation is essential to the organization's positive performance in general and the marketing function in particular (Walker and Ruekert, 1987) as well as to the achievement of a market orientation that allows it to respond to their customers' needs (Masiello, 1988).
Solutions suggested by the literature to minimize possible points of interfunctional conflict:	
Ruekert, Walker & Roering (1985)	Organizational designs favouring integration, such as mixed structures and the decentralization of authority.
Carroad and Carroad (1982)	Team building and transfer of staff to various functions for a limited time, matrix-type structures and the implementation of evaluation systems that reflect shared interests.
Clare and Sanford (1984)	Development of interdepartmental communication, with actions such as seminars, conventions and group interaction mechanisms
Jackson and Shapiro (1979)	Creation and implementation of models of integration and adjusment of functions.
Saghafi, Gupta and Sheth (1990); Lichtenthal & Wilson (1992)	Market orientation of functions other than marketing, so that "each employee must include an element of marketing in his activity."

Analysis of the different authors and main conclusions of the Dissemination of Information dimension, corresponding to Kohli and Jaworski's behavioural perspective of market orientation (1990). Source: in-house based on Cervera, A. (2004)

Table 3: Responsiveness to Information

RESPONSIVENESS TO INFORMATION	
► Development of plans (or design of the response).	
► Implementation of such plans (or implementation of the response).	
Study	**Responsiveness to information in order to satisfy market needs.**
Walsh (1989)	Identifies four similar dimensions in relation to the local government organizations' capacity of responsiveness to the public: access, quality, choice, participative control. Clarke and Stewart (1987);
Clarke and Stewart (1987); Grayson (1994)	Adds the quality of service provided, access, and choice, as well as other dimensions such as the modification of performance evaluation measures and the promotion of citizenship.

Analysis of the different authors and main conclusions of the Responsiveness to Information dimension, corresponding to Kohli and Jaworski's behavioural perspective of market orientation (1990). Source: in-house based on Cervera, A. (2004)

The variables that make up each of the dimensions must be specified on the basis of the dimensions, to thus conduct the analysis of market orientation from the Spanish cities' municipal website content.

DATA AND METHODOLOGY

The research conducted aims to analyze the market orientation of the capital cities of Spain's different regions. To achieve this, the content provided by each municipality's official website was used as a source. The use of the Internet and new information technologies in general as a marketing tool has been the object of numerous studies (Ju-Pak, 1999, Wilkie and Kollmann, 1998; Alet, 2001; Küster, 2002; Currás and Küster, 2005). However, from the field of marketing in urban management, research studies on the Internet's role as an environment for exchanging market information are not so numerous (Sicilia and Pérez, 2007).

From this perspective, the dimensions offered by the websites as a marketing tool (Küster, 2002; Currás and Küster, 2005) are given below:

Accessibility: The possibility offered by the website for accessing information. In the case of a municipality's official website, it enables the city's different constituencies to obtain the desired information.

Obtaining relevant information: refers to the fact that the website can provide information of interest to users. This dimension depends on the degree of knowledge it has of the target publics' needs. Aspects such as the degree of detail of the information, its updating, useful life of the information and the exclusivity thereof are included in this characteristic.

Handling complaints: the possibility offered by the Internet to handle complaints and claims quickly and efficiently makes this medium a customer-oriented and therefore, marketing tool.

Cost advantages (Sicilia and Pérez, 2007): these websites offer a wealth of information at a low cost. It is only necessary to have a domain in which to post information for the different target audiences.

Customer Service: The website is designed to provide customer service, this medium being a suitable tool for analyzing the dimensions of the market orientation of the management of both business organizations and, in this case, cities. Furthermore, this medium, which is accessible round the clock from any point in the world, increases the amplitude of communication with the urban market.

The methodology for collecting information on the cities under study is based on an analysis of content (Bigné, 1999) and its specific application to the analysis of websites (Dholakia and Rego, 1998;

Rodriguez, 2002; Bellman *et al*, 2006). To achieve this, the target population was first designated and the sample selected.

In this case, the target populations were the official municipal websites of the Spanish cities that are capitals of their respective regional communities. A total of 18 cities were analyzed: Madrid, Barcelona, Las Palmas de Gran Canaria, Tenerife, Pamplona, Santander, Santiago de Compostela, Valencia, Vitoria, Saragossa, Logroño, Toledo, Oviedo, Merida, Murcia, Valladolid, Seville and Palma de Majorca for Spain's 17 regions (Las Palmas de Gran Canaria and Santa Cruz de Tenerife share being the Canary capital), which represents 100% of the population under study. Secondly, we defined the unit of analysis, which was the city's official municipal website. Next, the variables under study were quantified by means of at least two content coders (Bigné, 1999). The information was collected using the same computer, same browser and same Internet connection to thus guarantee equal speed. In addition, the information was confirmed by those responsible for municipal management through communication via the e-mail address available on the Web, in cases when the contents analyzed were not completely clarified.

This study analyzed 14 variables (see Table 4) corresponding to the three dimensions of Kohli and Jaworski's market orientation model (1990). The variables corresponding to the three dimensions analyzed on the municipal website were quantified and the variables defined as mixed or scale, which allowed for their statistical analysis; the same statistical techniques were applied as those used to analyse the numeric variables. Hence, e.g., the number of opinion polls variable will take the value of one for municipalities that conducted from zero to ten surveys, a value of two for municipalities that conducted from eleven to twenty surveys and a value of three for the municipalities that conducted more than twenty surveys. The remaining variables were defined in a similar manner. The variables analyzed were:

Generation of Information is the first dimension to consider in the market orientation model. In this paper, Generation of Information involves rating the municipal management of the collection and analysis of information on the current and future needs of citizens, businesses, investors and visitors as the cities' target public. It also involves collecting and analyzing information on other competing cities, which may influence the current and future needs of the city's target public. On the basis of this approach, the following variables were considered: number of opinion polls conducted, number of municipal networks to which the city belongs, incidents, complaints and suggestions through the municipal website, number of online surveys on the service provided through it and citizen participation on the website.

The Dissemination of Information dimension for a city's different target publics, which allows the information generated to be shared, was analyzed by means of the following variables: number of municipal periodicals, number of councils, number of languages on the municipal website, number of languages on the tourism website.

The implementation of a response requires the use of management tools and instruments such as strategic planning processes in the different areas of management, as well as the use of marketing strategies and response actions, such as market segmentation or the search for differentiation and proper positioning. In this context, we analyzed the following variables as Responsiveness to Information: number of segments into which the tourism website is divided, number of plans in place, including the Strategic Plan (SP), number of segments into which the municipal website is divided, number of social networks to which the municipality belongs and public/private collaboration between the municipality and the city's major private stakeholders.

Also included as a variable to be analyzed was the municipal budget for each city in question, to the extent that available financial resources may explain differences in behaviour between the cities.

Table 4: Study Variables

	Study Variables	Type of Variable
1	2011 municipal budget	Mixed (scale)
	Variables corresponding to the "Generation of information" dimension	
2	Nº of opinion polls conducted	Mixed (scale)
3	Nº of municipal networks to which the city belongs	Mixed (scale)
4	Incidences, complaints and suggestions through the municipal website	Mixed (scale)
5	Nº of on-line surveys on services provided by the website	Mixed (scale)
6	Citizen participation on the website	Mixed (scale)
	Variables corresponding to the "Dissemination of information" dimension	
7	Nº of municipal periodicals	Mixed (scale)
8	Nº of councils	Mixed (scale)
9	Nº of languages on the municipal websites	Mixed (scale)
10	Nº of languages on the tourism websites	Mixed (scale)
	Variables corresponding to the "Responsiveness to information" dimension	
11	Nº of segments in which the tourism website is divided	Mixed (scale)
12	Nº of plans underway including the strategic plan (SP)	Mixed (scale)
13	Nº of segments into which the municipal website is divided	Mixed (scale)
14	Nº of social networks to which the municipality belongs	Mixed (scale)
15	Public/Private collaboration between the municipality and the city's main private stakeholders	Mixed (scale)

A total of 15 variables corresponding to the three dimensions of Kohli and Jaworski's market orientation model (1990) were analysed. Also included as a variable to be analyzed was the municipal budget of each city under study. Source: in-house. Data processing: Dyane version 4.

RESULTS

The cluster analysis was performed using Johnson's algorithm, the complete linkage method, which is best suited to small samples such as this case, with 18 cities and 15 variables.

The first analysis obtained Cluster 1, which is made up of the cities of Barcelona and Madrid. Cluster 2 is formed by the cities of Las Palmas de Gran Canaria, Murcia, Logroño, Santa Cruz de Tenerife, Santander, and Merida. Cluster 3 includes the cities of Oviedo, Toledo, Santiago de Compostela, Valencia and Valladolid. Lastly, Cluster 4 is formed by the cities of Palma de Mallorca, Pamplona, Seville, Vitoria and Saragossa (see Figure 1). The variance explained by the participation in the four clusters is 61.88%. (See Table 5).

Table 5: Variance of the Variables Explained by the Partition

Sum of the squares of all the simple variables	168.61
Sum of the intracluster squares (remaining variance)	64.27
Sum of the intercluster squares (explained variance)	104.34
% of variance explained by the partition into 4 clusters	61.88%

The cluster analysis presents a variance explained by the participation in the four clusters of 61.88 %. Source: in-house. Data processing: Dyane version 4.

Table 6 shows the cross tabulation of mean values, which is designed to check for differences between the mean values of the variables used, calculated for the total sample, and for each of the groups generated in the "cluster", which are considered as a column or independent variable.

To determine whether these differences are significant or not, we used the Snedecor's *F* statistic with (c-1) and (n-c) degrees of freedom, which allows the null hypothesis to be tested, i.e., the non-difference between means. As shown in Table 6, with variables number 1 (2011 municipal budget), 5 (number of online surveys), 6 (public participation), 7 (number of municipal periodicals), 9 (number of languages on the municipal website), 10 (number of languages on the tourism website), 12 (number of plans underway), 14 (number of social networks to which the municipality belongs), the differences between the means of the cluster are significant for a level of significance ($p < 0.05$), i.e., indicating the rejection of

the null hypothesis (no difference between means). For the same level of significance, the other variables are not significant.

Table 6: Cross-Tabulation of Standard Deviations and Means of the Variables in the Clusters Generated (With Snedecor's F Proof / ANOVA Table)

N º	Identification of variables	Clusters Originated by the Partition	Cluster 1	Cluster 2	Cluster 3	Cluster 4	Snedecor's F
		Nº of integrants Statistics	18	2	6	5	5
1	2011 Municipal budget	Mean:	1.78	**6.00 +**	1.00 -	1.20	1.60	$F(3.14) = 31.98$
		Std. Dev.	1.62	1.00	0.00	0.40	0.80	$p = 0.0000$
2	Survey – G.Information	Mean:	1.28	**1.50 +**	1.00 -	1.40	1.40	$F(3.14) = 1.14$
		Std. Dev.	0.45	0.50	0.00	0.49	0.49	$p = 0.3655$
3	Networks - G.Information	Mean:	1.44	1.50	1.17 -	**1.80 +**	1.40	$F(3.14) = 0.56$
		Std. Dev.	0.76	0.50	0.37	0.98	0.80	$p = 0.6529$
4	Incidence - G.Information	Mean:	1.17	1.00	1.17	**1.40 +**	1.00 -	$F(3.14) = 1.07$
		Std. Dev.	0.37	0.00	0.37	0.49	0.00	$p = 0.3930$
5	Survey - G.Information	Mean:	1.06	**1.50 +**	1.00	1.00	1.00 -	$F(3.14) = 4.15$
		Std. Dev.	0.23	0.50	0.00	0.00	0.00	$p = 0.0268$
6	Cit. Part - G.Information	Mean:	1.61	1.00 -	1.83	**2.00 +**	1.20	$F(3.14) = 7.56$
		Std. Dev.	0.49	0.00	0.37	0.00	0.40	$p = 0.0030$
7	Periodicals – D. Information	Mean:	1.33	**3.00 +**	1.00	1.00 -	1.40	$F(3.14) = 9.92$
		Std. Dev.	0.75	1.00	0.00	0.00	0.49	$p = 0.0009$
8	Councils - D. Information	Mean:	1.67	**2.00 +**	2.00	1.40	1.40 -	$F(3.14) = 1.17$
		Std. Dev.	0.67	1.00	0.58	0.49	0.49	$p = 0.3575$
9	Lenweb - D. Information	Mean:	1.89	1.50	1.33 -	1.40	**3.20 +**	$F(3.14) = 14.54$
		Std. Dev.	0.94	0.50	0.47	0.49	0.40	$p = 0.0001$
10	LenTuris D. Information	Mean:	2.89	3.50	1.33 -	**4.00 +**	3.40	$F(3.14) = 34.99$
		Std. Dev.	1.20	0.50	0.47	0.00	0.49	$p = 0.0000$
11	Tur. Seg. - R. Information	Mean:	1.72	1.50 -	**1.83 +**	1.80	1.60	$F(3.14) = 0.18$
		Std. Dev.	0.65	0.50	0.90	0.40	0.49	$p = 0.9104$
12	Plans - R. Information	Mean:	2.17	**4.00 +**	1.50 -	2.00	2.40	$F(3.14) = 5.26$
		Std. Dev.	1.01	0.00	0.76	0.63	0.80	$p = 0.0122$
13	SegWeb - R. Information	Mean:	1.28	1.00 -	1.17	**1.60 +**	1.20	$F(3.14) = 1.28$
		Std. Dev.	0.45	0.00	0.37	0.49	0.40	$p = 0.3193$
14	Social Nets. R. Information	Mean:	1.33	**2.00 +**	1.00	1.00 -	1.80	$F(3.14) = 5.33$
		Std. Dev.	0.58	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.75	$p = 0.0116$
15	CPP - R. Information	Mean:	1.56	1.50	**1.83 +**	1.40	1.40 -	$F(3.14) = 0.89$
		Std. Dev.	0.50	0.50	0.37	0.49	0.49	$p = 0.4709$

+ : Cluster with the highest mean; - : Cluster with the lowest mean Source: In-house. Data processing: Dyane version 4
This table shows the cross tabulation of mean values, which is designed to check for differences between the mean values of the variables used, calculated for the total sample and for each of the groups generated in the "Cluster".

Based on the analysis of the content of the municipal websites of the cities analyzed, this table shows that Cluster 1, comprising the cities of Barcelona and Madrid, has the highest mean in the following variables: municipal budget, number of opinion polls conducted, number of on-line surveys, number of municipal periodicals, number of councils, implementation of plans and membership in social networks, giving equal weight to the three dimensions of Kohli and Jaworski's behaviour model of market orientation (1990).

Cluster 2, comprising the cities of Las Palmas de Gran Canaria, Murcia, Logroño, Santa Cruz de Tenerife, Santander, and Merida, has the highest mean in the following variables: number of segments into which the tourism website is divided and public-private partnership between the municipality and the city's main private stakeholders. Both of these variables belong to the Responsiveness to Information dimension in the behavioural model.

The cities in Cluster 3, made up of Oviedo, Toledo, Santiago de Compostela, Valencia and Valladolid, have the highest mean in the following variables: number of municipal networks to which the city belongs, incidents, complaints and suggestions through the municipal website, citizen participation webpage, number of languages on the tourism website and number of segments into which the municipal

website is divided. Although these variables cover the three dimensions of the behavioural model of market orientation, the Generation of Information dimension has the highest representation.

Cluster 4 is composed of the cities of Palma de Mallorca, Pamplona, Seville, Vitoria and Saragossa and is not characterized by higher means in almost any of the variables analyzed, which correspond to the three dimensions of Kohli and Jaworski's behavioural model of market orientation (1990).

This study proposes a framework for measuring market orientation through the content of the municipal website. The variables that allow the measurement of market orientation based on the three dimensions of Kohli and Jaworski's behavioural perspective (1990) and allow to classify them in relation to the target public to which they are aimed (Resident, Tourist and Investor), are shown in the next table:

Table 7: Variables to Be Considered in Modelling the Measurement of the City's Market Orientation through the Content of the Municipal Website

Panel A: Other Variables										
	Var. A			Var. B			Var. C			
	Nº of inhabitants in the city			Regional GNP			Municipal budget			
CITIES										
Panel B: Generation of Information										
	Opinion Polls Conducted			MembershipiIn Municipal Networks	Incidences, Complaints and Suggestions			On-Line Surveys of Services Provided Through the Website			Citizen Participation on the Website
	C	T	I		C	T	I	C	T	I	C
CITIES										
Panel C: Dissemination of Information										
	Municipal Periodicals			Information on Councils	Use of Different Languages for the Information on the Website			Services Provided to Different Target Publics Through the Internet			Updated Municipal Budget Available
	C	T	I	C	C	T	I	C	T	I	C
CITIES										
Panel D: Responsiveness to information										
	Strategic Plan Underway (*) Action Plans			Social Networks to Which the City Belongs			Public/Private Collaboration (P.P.C.)			Presence of the Different Target Publics in the Website Segments
	C	T	I	C	T	I	C	T	I	C	T	I
CITIES										

Panel A shows the variables to be considered in modelling the measurement of the city's market orientation through thecontent of the municipal website when they do not belong to the behavioural model. Source: in-house. Panel B shows the variables to be considered in modelling the measurement of the city's market orientation through the content of the municipal website when they belong to the Generation of Information dimension of the behavioural model. Source: in-house. Panel C shows the variables to be considered in modelling the measurement of the city's market orientation through the content of the municipal website when they belong to the Dissemination of Information dimension of the behavioural model. Source: in-house. Panel D shows the variables to be considered in modelling the measurement of the city's market orientation through the content of the municipal website when they belong to the Responsiveness of Information dimension of the behavioural model. Source: in-house. (*) Strategic Plan in place: Whether or not the strategic objectives covers action lines and focal points for each one of the city's different target publics must be verified. The city's different target publics : C= Citizen, residents, T= Tourist, Visitor, I= Investor, businesses

CONCLUDING COMMENTS

This paper aims to analyze the market orientation of a cluster of Spanish cities that are the capitals of their autonomous regions through the analysis of their municipal website content. The analysis considered a set of variables representing the different dimensions that shape market orientation. The variables were collected during the year 2011, and the cluster analysis, to classify them, was performed using Johnson's algorithm, the complete linkage method, which is best suited to small samples such as this case, with 18 cities and 15 variables.

The investigation of the 18 Spanish regional capital cities, based on the analysis of a cluster of fifteen variables representing Kohli and Jaworski's behavioural perspective of market orientation (1990), allows for the verification of four clusters that are differentiated in terms of the importance they attach to the different dimensions of market orientation based on the analysis of the municipal website content.

Cluster 1 (Barcelona and Madrid) gives equal weight to the three dimensions analyzed. They are also the cities with the largest budgets. Cluster 2 (Las Palmas de Gran Canaria, Murcia, Logroño, Santa Cruz de Tenerife, Santander and Merida), focuses on seeking responsiveness to market needs and places more importance on the responsiveness dimension than the information dimension.The cities in Cluster 3 (Oviedo, Toledo, Santiago de Compostela, Valencia and Valladolid) seek to understand the needs of their target public, which involves placing a higher priority on the Generation of Information dimension. Cluster 4 (Palma de Mallorca, Pamplona, Seville, Vitoria and Saragossa), is characterized by the low means in the variables analyzed. These cities adopt a loosely defined role with respect to the dimensions.

In this study, we propose a framework for measuring market orientation through the content of the municipal website, in which we distributed the variables that allow us to measure market orientation in the three dimensions of Kohli and Jaworski's behavioural perspective of market orientation (1990); it also allowed us to classify the variables in relation to the target public to which they are aimed (Resident, Tourist and Investor).

The paper has a natural limitation due to the limited number of cities considered (regional capital cities in Spain). For future research, we aim to expand the number of cities to be analyzed and differentiate the cities within each dimension by the actions they aim at their respective target publics, taking into account the variables and the model template proposed.

ANNEX

Annex 1: Table of the Municipal Websites Used in the Analysis

MUNICIPALITY OF BARCELONA www.bcn.es	MUNICIPALITY OF S. DE COMPOSTELA www.santiagodecompostela.org
MUNICIPALITY OF LAS PALMAS DE GRAN CANARIA www.laspalmasgc.es	MUNICIPALITY OF SANTANDER www.ayto.santander.es
MUNICIPALITY OF LOGROÑO www.logro-o.org/	MUNICIPALITY OF VALENCIA www.valencia.es
MUNICIPALITY OF MADRID www.munimadrid.es.	MUNICIPALITY OF VALLADOLID www.ava.es
MUNICIPALITY OF MÉRIDA www.merida.es	MUNICIPALITY OF VITORIA www.vitoria-gasteiz.org
MUNICIPALITY OF MURCIA www.murcia.es	MUNICIPALITY OF SARAGOSSA www.zaragoza.es
MUNICIPALITY OF OVIEDO www.oviedo.es	MUNICIPALITY OF SANTA CRUZ DE TENERIFE www.sctfe.es
MUNICIPALITY OF PALMA DE MALLORCA www.a-palma.es	MUNICIPALITY OF SEVILLE www.sevilla.org
MUNICIPALITY OF PAMPLONA www.pamplona.net	MUNICIPALITY OF TOLEDO www.ayto-toledo.org

This table includes the names and e-mail addresses of the municipal websites used in the analysis of content. Source: In-house.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Alet, J. (2001). *Marketing eficaz.com*. Ediciones Gestión 2000, Barcelona.

Bellman, S.; Johnson, E.; Lohse, G.; y Mandel, N. (2006) "Designing Marketplaces of the Artificial With Consumer Behavior in Electronic Environments", *Journal of Interactive Marketing*, nº 20 (1), pp. 21-33.

Bigné Alcañiz, E. (1999) "El Análisis de contenido" in *Metodología para la Investigación en Marketing y Dirección de Empresas* (coordina F.J.Sarabia). Ediciones Pirámide, Madrid, pp.253-263.

Blackman, T. (1994) "Research in Local Government: An Assessment of Qualitative Research", *Local Government Studies*, vol. 19, nº 2 (Summer), pp. 242-263.

Burns, T. (1992) "Researching Customer Service in the Public Sector", *Journal of the Market Research Society*, vol 34, nº 1, pp. 53-60.

Carroad, P.A.; and Carroad, C.A. (1982) "Strategic Interfacing of R&D and Marketing", *Research Management, January*, pp. 28-33.

Cervera, A. (2004) "Orientación al Mercado y Administración Pública Local: determinación de un modelo teórico y de medición", *Revista Internacional de Marketing Público y No Lucrativo*, vol. 1, nº 1, pp. 53-72.

Cervera, A.; Mollá, A.; and Calderón, H. (1999) "Market Orientation: A Framework for Public Institutions", *Journal of Nonprofit & Public Sector Marketing*, vol. 7, nº 1, pp. 3-24.

Clare, D.; and Sanford, D.G. (1984) "Cooperation and Conflict between Industrial Sales and Production", *Industrial Marketing Management*, nº 13, pp. 163-169.

Clarke M.; and Stewart, J. (1988). *The Enabling Council*. Luton: Local Government Training Board.

Clarke, M.; and Stewart, J. (1987) "The Public Service Orientation: Issues and Dilemmas", *Public Administration*, Vol. 65, Summer, pp. 161-177.

Cowell, D.W. (1981) "The Role of Market Research in the Development of Public Policy in the Field of Recreation and Leisure", *Journal of the Market Research Society*, vol. 23, nº 2, pp. 72-83.

Crittenden, V.; Gardiner, L.R.; y Stam, A. (1993) "Reducing Conflict between Marketing and Manufacturing", *Industrial Marketing Management*, nº 22, pp. 299-309.

Currás, R. and Küster, I. (2005) "Internet como herramienta de marketing de relaciones en España. Estudio de las principales empresas españolas", *Investigación y Marketing*, nº 84, pp. 29-40.

Dholakia, U.; and Rego, L. (1998) "What makes commercial Web pages popular ¿An empirical investigation of Web page effectiveness", *European Journal of Marketing*, nº 32 (7/8), pp. 724-736.

Grayson, L. (1994). *Quality of Life in Cities*. London: The British Library Board.

Jackson, B.B.; and Shapiro, B.P. (1979) "New Way to Make Product Line Decisions", *Harvard Business Review*, May-June, pp. 139-149.

Ju-Pak, K.H. (1999) "Content Dimensions of Web Advertising: A Cross-National Comparison", *International Journal of Advertising*, nº18, pp. 207-231.

Kerley, R. (1994). *Managing in Local Government*. London: MacMillan.

Kohli, A.K.; and Jaworski, B.J. (1990) "Market orientation: the construct, research propositions, and managerial implications", *Journal of Marketing*, vol. 54, nº 2, pp. 1-18.

Küster, I.(2002). *La venta relacional*. Ediciones ESIC. Madrid.
Lichtenthal, J. D.; and Wilson, D. (1992) "Becoming Market Oriented", *Journal of Business Research*, nº 24, pp. 191-207.

Martín Armario, J.M; Ruiz, D.; and Martín Armario, E. (2002) "Market orientation and internationalization in small and medium-sized enterprises", *Journal of Small Business Management*, vol. 46, nº 4, pp. 485–512.

Masiello, T. (1988) "Developing Market Responsiveness Through Your Company", *Industrial Marketing Management*, vol. 17, nº 2 (May), pp. 85-93.

Narver, J.C.; and Slater, S.F. (1990) "The effects of market orientation on business profitability", *Journal of Marketing*, vol. 54, nº 4, pp. 20-35.

Rodriguez Ardura, I.(2002) *Marketing.com y Comercio Electrónico en la Sociedad de la Información*, Ediciones ESIC, Madrid.

Ruekert R.W.; Walker, O.C.; and Roering, K.J. (1985) "The Organization of Marketing Activities: A Contingency Theory of Structure and Performance", *Journal of Marketing*, vol. 59, nº 4 (October), pp. 13-25.

Saghafi, M.; Gupta, A.; and Sheth, J.N. (1990) "R&D/Marketing Interfaces in the Telecommunications Industry", *Industrial Marketing Management*, nº 19, pp. 87-94.

Severijnen, P. (1994) "Local Authorities and Market Research: Market Research Incorporated in the Policy Process of Consumer-Oriented Local Authorities", *Local Government Studies*, vol. 20,nº , pp. 34-43.

Sicilia, M.; and Pérez, R. (2007) "Internet como herramienta de marketing de ciudades. Análisis de contenidos de las webs de las capitales europeas", *Investigación y Marketing*, nº 96, pp. 30-40.

Tuominen, M.; and Möller, K. (1996). *Market Orientation: A State of the Art Review*. J. Beracs, A. Bauer and J. Simon(eds). Marketing for an expanded future. 25 EMAC Conference, Budapest, 14-17 mayo.

Varadajan P. R.; and Clark, T. (1994) "Delineating the Scope of Corporate, Business and Marketing Strategy", *Journal of Business Research*, nº 31, pp. 93-105.

Walker O.C.; and Ruekert, R.W. (1987) "Marketing's Role in the Implementation of Business Strategies: A Critical Review and Conceptual Framework", *Journal of Marketing*, vol. 61, nº 3 (July), pp. 15-33.

Walsh, K. (1989). *Marketing in Local Government*. Essex (UK): Longman

Wilkie, W. L.; and Kollmann, T. (1998) "Competitive Advantages in Virtual Markets Perspectives of Information Based Marketing Cyberspace", *European Journal of Marketing*, 32, pp. 603-615.

BIOGRAPHY

Lucía Sáez is a professor in the department of Financial Economics II at the Public University of the Basque Country. Her main line of research is municipal marketing. She can be contacted at the Unidad Delegada de la Facultad de CC.EE y Empresariales, Plaza de Oñati 1, 20080 Donostia-San Sebastián, Gipuzkoa, Spain. e-mail: lucia.saez@ehu.es

Iñaki Periáñez holds a doctorate and is a full professor of marketing in the department of Financial Economics II at the Public University of the Basque Country. His main lines of research are: municipal marketing, political marketing and quality in higher education. He can be contacted at the Facultad de CC.EE y Empresariales, Avda Lehendakari Aguirre 83. 48015 Bilbao, Bizkaia, Spain. e-mail: inaki.perianez@ehu.es